

Chullin – Simanim

פרק ט – העור והרוטב

דף קכט – Daf 129

1. כשישימש מעשה עץ שימש

The Gemara discusses a כזית of meat cut off from an אבר מן החי with the intent to use it as food (for non-Jews). As food, it contracts *tumah* from the אבר מן החי, provided that it first undergoes הכשר for *tumah*. Although it was previously *metamei* with טומאה חמורה – severe *tumah* as [part of an] אבר מן החי, and should presumably not require הכשר, Rava explains: כשישימש מעשה עץ שימש – when it served as part of something that was *metamei* with טומאה חמורה, it served the function of wood, not food. Therefore, when it later assumes the status as food it requires הכשר like any other food. The Gemara proceeds to answer five additional questions with this principle. For example, כופת, a block of leaven which one designated for sitting loses its status as חמץ (and may be kept on Pesach), and becomes a seat susceptible to the טומאה חמורה of מושב. This *tumah* may be דאורייתא, yet is not an example of food transmitting טומאה חמורה, because the leaven is serving as a מעשה עץ (i.e., a seat), not as food.

2. Rebbe Shimon: food forbidden even to non-Jews cannot become *tamei*

In the Mishnah on Daf 127b, Rebbe Meir said that after an animal dies, its formerly dangling flesh requires הכשר before it can become *tamei*, while the dangling אבר is *metamei* as an אבר מן החי. The Mishnah concludes that Rebbe Shimon rules “it” *tahor*, and after extensive discussion, the Gemara concludes that Rebbe Shimon is referring to the בשר (the אבר, however, is *tamei* as אבר מן החי). Rebbe Yochanan explains that Rebbe Shimon infers from the *passuk* “אוכל שאי אתה יכול להאכילו לאחרים קרוי אוכל” – food which you may feed to others (i.e., non-Jews) is called “food,” but אוכל אשר יאכל – food which you may not feed to others is not called “food” regarding *tumah* of food. Since בשר מן החי is forbidden even to gentiles, it cannot contract טומאת אוכלין.

3. The difference between a human אבר מן החי and אבר מן המת

The next Mishnah states that a person’s dangling אבר or flesh is *tahor*. If he dies, the dangling flesh remains *tahor*, because it is viewed as if it fell off just before his death, and this Tanna holds human אבר מן החי is *tahor*. The formerly dangling אבר is *metamei* as אבר מן החי, but not as a limb from a dead body. [A Baraisa records Rebbe Eliezer’s tradition that an אבר מן המת is *tahor*, but Rebbe Yehoshua argues from a *kal vachomer*: if an אבר מן החי is *tamei*, an אבר מן המת is certainly *tamei*.] The practical difference between whether an אבר is *tamei* as אבר מן החי or as אבר מן המת concerns a כזית of flesh and עצם כשעורה – a bone the size of a barleycorn. A Mishnah states: כזית בשר – a kezayis of flesh which separates from a limb severed from a living [person], Rebbe Eliezer rules it *tamei*, while Rebbe Nechunya ben Hakanah and Rebbe Yehoshua rule it *tahor*. Regarding an עצם כשעורה which separated from an אבר מן החי, Rebbe Nechunya rules it *tamei*, while Rebbe Eliezer and Rebbe Yehoshua rule it *tahor*. Thus, when our Mishnah, which follows Rebbe Yehoshua, classifies the dangling אבר as an אבר מן החי, it means that flesh or bone which separates from it is *tahor*.

Siman – Cactus

The man sitting near a **cactus** on a **sourdough bench** on Pesach, which is allowed because it’s מעשה עץ שימש, informed the rescue workers cleaning up from a deadly collision a rider had with a **cactus** that the previously dangling meat on the dead bull is not טמא because its forbidden for a goy to eat, and the dangling flesh from the dead rider is טהור while the dangling אבר is טמא because of אבר מן החי.

דף קכט | DAF 129

Cactus



The man sitting near a **cactus** on a **sourdough** bench on Pesach, which is allowed because it's **מעשה עץ**, informed the rescue workers cleaning up from a deadly collision a rider had with a **cactus** that the previously dangling meat on the dead bull is not **טמא** because its forbidden for a **goy** to eat, and the dangling flesh from the dead rider is **טהור** while the dangling **אבר** is **טמא** because of **החי**.

3 things to remember

1. כשימש מעשה עץ שימש
2. Rebbe Shimon: food forbidden even to non-Jews cannot become *tamei*
3. The difference between a human **אבר מן החי** and **המת**

